

**Part Two**

**Exceptions to the Freedom of  
Information Act 2000 and the  
Freedom of Information (Scotland)  
Act 2002**

Dr R S Baxter  
Seridigm Consultants



Business  
Information

# Exceptions to access rights

Dr R S Baxter  
Seridigm Consultants

	<b>Page</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1-7</b>
1.1 Background	1-7
1.2 Context	1-7
1.3 Prejudice test	1-7
1.4 Public interest test	1-8
<b>2 Overview of the exemptions</b>	<b>1-11</b>
<b>3 Information accessible to the applicant by other means</b>	<b>1-15</b>
3.1 The exemption explained	1-15
3.2 Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-18
3.3 Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-18
3.4 FOIA implementation guidance	1-18
3.5 FOIA case law	1-19
3.6 FOISA implementation guidance	1-19
3.7 FOISA case law	1-20
<b>4 Information intended for future publication</b>	<b>1-21</b>
4.1 The exemption explained	1-21
4.2 Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-21
4.3 Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-22
4.4 FOIA implementation guidance	1-22
4.5 FOIA case law	1-23
4.6 FOISA implementation guidance	1-23
4.7 FOISA case law	1-24
<b>5 Information supplied by, or relating to, bodies dealing with security matters</b>	<b>1-24</b>
5.1 The exemption explained	1-24
5.2 Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-25
5.3 Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-25
5.4 FOIA implementation guidance	1-25
5.5 FOIA case law	1-25
<b>6 National security</b>	<b>1-25</b>
6.1 The exemption explained	1-25
6.2 Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-26
6.3 Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-26
6.4 FOIA implementation guidance	1-26
6.5 FOIA case law	1-26
6.6 FOISA implementation guidance	1-26
6.7 FOISA case law	1-27

<b>7</b>	<b>Defence</b>	<b>1-27</b>
7.1	The exemption explained	1-27
7.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-27
7.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-27
7.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-27
7.5	FOIA case law	1-28
7.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-28
7.7	FOISA case law	1-29
<b>8</b>	<b>International relations</b>	<b>1-29</b>
8.1	The exemption explained	1-29
8.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-29
8.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-30
8.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-30
8.5	FOIA case law	1-31
8.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-32
8.7	FOISA case law	1-32
<b>9</b>	<b>Relations within the United Kingdom</b>	<b>1-33</b>
9.1	The exemption explained	1-33
9.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-33
9.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-33
9.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-33
9.5	FOIA case law	1-34
9.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-34
9.7	FOISA case law	1-35
<b>10</b>	<b>The economy</b>	<b>1-35</b>
10.1	The exemption explained	1-35
10.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-36
10.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-36
10.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-36
10.5	FOIA case law	1-37
10.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-38
10.7	FOISA case law	1-38
<b>11</b>	<b>Investigations and proceedings conducted by public authorities</b>	<b>1-38</b>
11.1	The exemption explained	1-38
11.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-39
11.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-40
11.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-40
11.5	FOIA case law	1-41
11.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-42
11.7	FOISA case law	1-42
<b>12</b>	<b>Law enforcement</b>	<b>1-43</b>
12.1	The exemption explained	1-43
12.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-44

12.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-45
12.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-45
12.5	FOIA case law	1-45
12.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-47
12.7	FOISA case law	1-47
<b>13</b>	<b>Court records, etc.</b>	<b>1-48</b>
13.1	The exemption explained	1-48
13.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-48
13.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-49
13.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-49
13.5	FOIA case law	1-50
13.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-50
13.7	FOISA case law	1-50
<b>14</b>	<b>Audit functions</b>	<b>1-51</b>
14.1	The exemption explained	1-51
14.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-51
14.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-51
14.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-52
14.5	FOIA case law	1-52
14.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-52
14.7	FOISA case law	1-53
<b>15</b>	<b>Parliamentary privilege</b>	<b>1-53</b>
15.1	The exemption explained	1-53
15.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-53
15.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-53
15.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-53
15.5	FOIA case law	1-54
<b>16</b>	<b>Formulation of government policy</b>	<b>1-54</b>
16.1	The exemption explained	1-54
16.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-54
16.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-55
16.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-55
16.5	FOIA case law	1-56
16.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-57
16.7	FOISA case law	1-57
<b>17</b>	<b>Prejudice to effective conduct of public affairs</b>	<b>1-58</b>
17.1	The exemption explained	1-58
17.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-58
17.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-59
17.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-59
17.5	FOIA case law	1-60
17.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-61
17.7	FOISA case law	1-61

<b>18</b>	<b>Communications with Her Majesty, etc. and honours</b>	<b>1-62</b>
18.1	The exemption explained	1-62
18.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-63
18.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-63
18.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-63
18.5	FOIA case law	1-64
18.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-64
18.7	FOISA case law	1-64
<b>19</b>	<b>Health and safety</b>	<b>1-64</b>
19.1	The exemption explained	1-64
19.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-65
19.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-65
19.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-65
19.5	FOIA case law	1-66
19.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-66
19.7	FOISA case law	1-66
<b>20</b>	<b>Environmental information</b>	<b>1-67</b>
20.1	The exemption explained	1-67
20.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-68
20.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-69
<b>21</b>	<b>Personal information</b>	<b>1-69</b>
21.1	The exemption explained	1-69
21.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-71
21.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-72
21.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-72
21.5	FOIA case law	1-73
21.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-75
21.7	FOISA case law	1-76
<b>22</b>	<b>Information provided in confidence</b>	<b>1-78</b>
22.1	The exemption explained	1-78
22.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-78
22.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-79
22.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-79
22.5	FOIA case law	1-80
22.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-81
22.7	FOISA case law	1-82
<b>23</b>	<b>Legal professional privilege</b>	<b>1-83</b>
23.1	The exemption explained	1-83
23.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-83
23.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-83
23.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-84
23.5	FOIA case law	1-85

23.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-86
23.7	FOISA case law	1-88
<b>24</b>	<b>Commercial interests</b>	<b>1-90</b>
24.1	The exemption explained	1-90
24.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-92
24.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-92
24.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-92
24.5	FOIA case law	1-93
24.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-94
24.7	FOISA case law	1-94
<b>25</b>	<b>Prohibitions on disclosure</b>	<b>1-95</b>
25.1	The exemption explained	1-95
25.2	Differences between the FOIA and the FOISA	1-96
25.3	Questions to be asked by the public authority wishing to use the exemption	1-96
25.4	FOIA implementation guidance	1-96
25.5	FOIA case law	1-96
25.6	FOISA implementation guidance	1-97
25.7	FOISA case law	1-97
<b>26</b>	<b>Dealing with exemptions</b>	<b>1-98</b>

# Environmental information

Dr R S Baxter  
Seridigm Consultants

	<b>Page</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>2-5</b>
<b>2 Government policy and legislation</b>	<b>2-6</b>
2.1 Introduction and policy background	2-6
2.2 The EC Directive 90/313/EEC	2-6
2.3 The Environmental Information Regulations 1992	2-6
2.4 The Aarhus Convention	2-6
2.5 The EU Directive 2003/4/EC	2-6
2.6 The Environmental Information Regulations 2004	2-7
2.7 The Code of Practice	2-7
2.8 Links to Freedom of Information legislation	2-8
2.9 Conclusions	2-8
<b>3 Scope of the Regulations</b>	<b>2-9</b>
3.1 Introduction	2-9
3.2 Scope as defined in the Convention and the new Directive	2-9
3.3 Scope as defined in the new Regulations	2-10
3.4 Likely implementation difficulties	2-11
3.5 Conclusions	2-12
<b>4 What is environmental information?</b>	<b>2-12</b>
4.1 Introduction	2-12
4.2 Environmental information as defined in the original Directive	2-12
4.3 Environmental information as defined in the Convention and the new Directive	2-15
4.4 Environmental information as defined in the new Regulations	2-16
4.5 Likely implementation difficulties	2-18
4.6 Conclusions	2-18
<b>5 Publishing environmental information</b>	<b>2-18</b>
5.1 Introduction	2-18
5.2 International requirements	2-19
5.3 Domestic requirements	2-20
5.3.1 General	2-20
5.3.2 Under the Freedom of Information Act	2-20
5.3.3 Under the Environmental Information Regulations	2-21
5.3.4 Under other statutes	2-22
5.4 How it should be done	2-23
5.5 Conclusions	2-24
<b>6 Handling information requests</b>	<b>2-24</b>
6.1 Introduction	2-24
6.2 Obligation to provide environmental information on request	2-25

6.3	Who may apply for environmental information?	2-26
6.4	Recognizing a request under the Environmental Information Regulations	2-26
6.5	Providing advice and assistance	2-28
6.6	Transferring requests	2-28
6.7	Consulting third parties	2-30
6.8	Imposing fees	2-30
6.9	Meeting deadlines	2-32
6.10	Supplying information	2-32
6.11	Copyright considerations	2-33
6.12	Withholding information	2-33
6.13	Giving responses	2-34
6.14	Complaints	2-35
6.15	Conclusions	2-36
<b>7</b>	<b>Grounds for refusing a request</b>	<b>2-36</b>
7.1	Introduction	2-36
7.2	Grounds for refusing a request	2-36
7.2.1	General	2-36
7.2.2	Information not held	2-38
7.2.3	Information still in the course of completion	2-38
7.2.4	Disclosure of internal communications	2-40
7.2.5	Manifestly unreasonable request	2-41
7.2.6	Request formulated in too general a manner	2-42
7.2.7	International relations, defence, national security or public safety	2-42
7.2.8	The course of justice	2-42
7.2.9	Intellectual property rights	2-44
7.2.10	The confidentiality of proceedings	2-44
7.2.11	The confidentiality of commercial or industrial information	2-45
7.2.12	Interests of the person who provided the information voluntarily	2-48
7.2.13	The protection of the environment	2-50
7.3	Personal information	2-50
7.4	The public interest test	2-52
7.5	Conclusions	2-53
<b>8</b>	<b>Dispute resolution</b>	<b>2-53</b>
8.1	Introduction	2-53
8.2	Internal review	2-54
8.3	Role of the Commissioner	2-54
8.4	Handling complaints	2-55
8.4.1	General	2-55
8.4.2	Information Notice	2-55
8.4.3	Decision Notice	2-55
8.4.4	Enforcement Notice	2-55

8.5	Failure to comply with a notice	2-57
8.6	The national courts	2-57
8.7	The European Court of Justice	2-57
8.8	Conclusions	2-57

# Commercial information

Peter Heywood and Nicola McKilligan

	<b>Page</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>3-3</b>
1.1 The extended impact of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 (FOIA)	3-3
1.2 Public/private partnerships (PPP) and private finance initiatives (PFI)?	3-4
<b>2 Commercial requirements and legal responsibilities</b>	<b>3-5</b>
2.1 Whose responsibility is FOI compliance?	3-5
2.2 Practical approaches	3-6
2.2.1 General	3-6
2.2.2 Who decides what information should be included in the Publication Scheme?	3-7
2.2.3 Selecting commercial information for publication	3-7
2.2.4 Practicalities of publishing information described in the scheme	3-8
2.2.5 Who handles access requests for unpublished information?	3-9
2.2.6 Who makes decisions in relation to access?	3-11
2.2.7 Complaints	3-11
2.2.8 Enforcement	3-11
2.2.9 Offence of altering, etc. records with intent to prevent disclosure	3-11
2.3 Infrastructures for ensuring access to information and the publication of information	3-12
2.4 Personnel and communication	3-14
2.4.1 Publication	3-14
2.4.2 Access	3-14
2.4.3 Records management	3-14
2.4.4 Training	3-15
2.5 Costs	3-16
<b>3 Protecting commercial contractors, their property and their staff</b>	<b>3-16</b>
3.1 General	3-16
3.2 Commercially sensitive and confidential information	3-17
3.3 Keeping a record	3-18
3.4 The Freedom of Information Act and intellectual property	3-18
3.5 Protecting the privacy of employees	3-19
3.6 Commercially motivated access requests	3-20
3.7 No way out	3-20
<b>4 Contracts, policies and planning for an open future</b>	<b>3-21</b>
4.1 Contracts	3-21
4.1.1 General	3-21
4.1.2 Why have a contract?	3-21
4.1.3 What might be included in a FOI contract	3-22

4.1.4	Managing contracts	3-22
4.1.5	What if the commercial organization refuses to cooperate?	3-28
4.2	Adapting to the culture of openness: project plans for commercial organizations and public authorities	3-28
<b>Annex A</b>	<b>Six-month plan for a public authority addressing FOIA issues with contractors</b>	<b>3-30</b>
<b>Annex B</b>	<b>Model policy for a public authority entering into large-scale PPP or PFI contracts</b>	<b>3-31</b>

# Personal information

Nicola McKilligan

	<b>Page</b>	
<b>1</b>	<b>FOI and data protection</b>	<b>4-3</b>
1.1	Introduction	4-3
1.2	Data protection and freedom of information – the overlap	4-3
1.3	Key exemptions which apply to personal data	4-4
1.4	Requests for data relating to the applicant	4-4
1.5	Duty to give advice and assistance	4-5
1.6	Mixed requests	4-5
<b>2</b>	<b>Dealing with a subject access request</b>	<b>4-5</b>
2.1	Establish whether a request is valid	4-5
2.2	Who should deal with the request?	4-5
2.3	What information must be provided?	4-6
2.4	Charging a fee for access to automated data or structured manual data	4-6
2.5	Unstructured personal data	4-6
2.6	Table summarizing costs for access	4-7
2.7	Responding within the statutory deadline	4-7
2.8	Refusing subject access requests	4-7
2.9	Information which identifies other individuals	4-8
2.10	Dealing with complaints about subject access	4-8
<b>3</b>	<b>Requests for personal data relating to third parties</b>	<b>4-8</b>
3.1	Exemption for personal data relating to living individuals	4-8
3.2	Exemption where a disclosure would breach the Data Protection Principles	4-9
3.3	What are the Data Protection Principles?	4-9
3.4	Personal data exempt from the right of subject access	4-13
<b>4</b>	<b>Other relevant exemptions</b>	<b>4-13</b>
4.1	Information provided in confidence	4-13
<b>5</b>	<b>Other exemptions under FOI</b>	<b>4-14</b>
5.1	Additional exemptions under Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act	4-14
5.1.1	Personal census information	4-14
5.1.2	Information contained within a deceased person’s health record	4-14
<b>6</b>	<b>Exemptions under the Environmental Information Regulations</b>	<b>4-14</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>Protection of employee information</b>	<b>4-15</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>Overview of managing a combined data protection and FOI access request</b>	<b>4-16</b>
<b>9</b>	<b>Quick guide</b>	<b>4-16</b>